

Type inference for let-free MiniML

Dieter Nazareth, Tobias Nipkow, Thomas Stauner, Markus Wenzel

October 1, 2005

Contents

1	Universal error monad	1
2	MiniML-types and type substitutions	2
2.1	Substitutions	2
2.1.1	Identity substitution	3
2.2	Most general unifiers	8
3	Mini-ML with type inference rules	8
4	Correctness and completeness of the type inference algorithm W	10
5	Equivalence of W and I	17

```
theory W0
imports Main
begin
```

1 Universal error monad

```
datatype 'a maybe = Ok 'a | Fail
```

```
constdefs
```

```
bind :: 'a maybe  $\Rightarrow$  ('a  $\Rightarrow$  'b maybe)  $\Rightarrow$  'b maybe (infixl bind 60)
m bind f  $\equiv$  case m of Ok r  $\Rightarrow$  f r | Fail  $\Rightarrow$  Fail
```

```
syntax
```

```
-bind :: patterns  $\Rightarrow$  'a maybe  $\Rightarrow$  'b  $\Rightarrow$  'c ((- := -;/-) 0)
```

```
translations
```

```
P := E; F == E bind ( $\lambda P. F$ )
```

```
lemma bind-Ok [simp]: (Ok s) bind f = (f s)
by (simp add: bind-def)
```

lemma *bind-Fail* [*simp*]: *Fail bind f = Fail*

by (*simp add: bind-def*)

lemma *split-bind*:

$P (res \text{ bind } f) = ((res = Fail \longrightarrow P \text{ Fail}) \wedge (\forall s. res = Ok \ s \longrightarrow P (f \ s)))$

by (*induct res*) *simp-all*

lemma *split-bind-asm*:

$P (res \text{ bind } f) = (\neg (res = Fail \wedge \neg P \text{ Fail} \vee (\exists s. res = Ok \ s \wedge \neg P (f \ s))))$

by (*simp split: split-bind*)

lemmas *bind-splits = split-bind split-bind-asm*

lemma *bind-eq-Fail* [*simp*]:

$((m \text{ bind } f) = Fail) = ((m = Fail) \vee (\exists p. m = Ok \ p \wedge f \ p = Fail))$

by (*simp split: split-bind*)

lemma *rotate-Ok*: $(y = Ok \ x) = (Ok \ x = y)$

by (*rule eq-sym-conv*)

2 MiniML-types and type substitutions

axclass *type-struct* \subseteq *type*

— new class for structures containing type variables

datatype *typ* = *TVar nat* | *TFun typ typ* (**infixr** \rightarrow 70)

— type expressions

types *subst* = *nat => typ*

— type variable substitution

instance *typ* :: *type-struct* ..

instance *list* :: (*type-struct*) *type-struct* ..

instance *fun* :: (*type*, *type-struct*) *type-struct* ..

2.1 Substitutions

consts

app-subst :: *subst* \Rightarrow '*a::type-struct* \Rightarrow '*a::type-struct* (\$)

— extension of substitution to type structures

primrec (*app-subst-typ*)

app-subst-TVar: $\$s \ (TVar \ n) = s \ n$

app-subst-Fun: $\$s \ (t1 \rightarrow t2) = \$s \ t1 \rightarrow \$s \ t2$

defs (**overloaded**)

app-subst-list: $\$s \equiv map \ (\$s)$

consts

$free-tv :: 'a::type-struct \Rightarrow nat\ set$
 — $free-tv\ s$: the type variables occuring freely in the type structure s

primrec ($free-tv-ty$)
 $free-tv\ (TVar\ m) = \{m\}$
 $free-tv\ (t1 \rightarrow t2) = free-tv\ t1 \cup free-tv\ t2$

primrec ($free-tv-list$)
 $free-tv\ [] = \{\}$
 $free-tv\ (x \# xs) = free-tv\ x \cup free-tv\ xs$

constdefs
 $dom :: subst \Rightarrow nat\ set$
 $dom\ s \equiv \{n. s\ n \neq TVar\ n\}$
 — domain of a substitution

 $cod :: subst \Rightarrow nat\ set$
 $cod\ s \equiv \bigcup m \in dom\ s. free-tv\ (s\ m)$
 — codomain of a substitutions: the introduced variables

defs
 $free-tv-subst: free-tv\ s \equiv dom\ s \cup cod\ s$

$new-tv\ s\ n$ checks whether n is a new type variable wrt. a type structure s , i.e. whether n is greater than any type variable occuring in the type structure.

constdefs
 $new-tv :: nat \Rightarrow 'a::type-struct \Rightarrow bool$
 $new-tv\ n\ ts \equiv \forall m. m \in free-tv\ ts \longrightarrow m < n$

2.1.1 Identity substitution

constdefs
 $id-subst :: subst$
 $id-subst \equiv \lambda n. TVar\ n$

lemma $app-subst-id-te$ [*simp*]:
 $\$id-subst = (\lambda t::typ. t)$
 — application of $id-subst$ does not change type expression

proof
 $\text{fix } t :: typ$
 $\text{show } \$id-subst\ t = t$
 $\text{by } (induct\ t)\ (simp-all\ add: id-subst-def)$
qed

lemma $app-subst-id-tel$ [*simp*]: $\$id-subst = (\lambda ts::typ\ list. ts)$
 — application of $id-subst$ does not change list of type expressions

proof
 $\text{fix } ts :: typ\ list$

show $\$id\text{-subst } ts = ts$
by (*induct ts*) (*simp-all add: app-subst-list*)
qed

lemma *o-id-subst* [*simp*]: $\$s \circ id\text{-subst} = s$
by (*rule ext*) (*simp add: id-subst-def*)

lemma *dom-id-subst* [*simp*]: $dom\ id\text{-subst} = \{\}$
by (*simp add: dom-def id-subst-def*)

lemma *cod-id-subst* [*simp*]: $cod\ id\text{-subst} = \{\}$
by (*simp add: cod-def*)

lemma *free-tv-id-subst* [*simp*]: $free\text{-tv } id\text{-subst} = \{\}$
by (*simp add: free-tv-subst*)

lemma *cod-app-subst* [*simp*]:
assumes *free*: $v \in free\text{-tv } (s\ n)$
and *neq*: $v \neq n$
shows $v \in cod\ s$
proof —
have $s\ n \neq TVar\ n$
proof
assume $s\ n = TVar\ n$
with *free* **have** $v = n$ **by** *simp*
with *neq* **show** *False* ..
qed
with *free* **show** ?thesis
by (*auto simp add: dom-def cod-def*)
qed

lemma *subst-comp-te*: $\$g (\$f\ t :: typ) = \$(\lambda x. \$g\ (f\ x))\ t$
— composition of substitutions
by (*induct t*) *simp-all*

lemma *subst-comp-tel*: $\$g (\$f\ ts :: typ\ list) = \$(\lambda x. \$g\ (f\ x))\ ts$
by (*induct ts*) (*simp-all add: app-subst-list subst-comp-te*)

lemma *app-subst-Nil* [*simp*]: $\$s\ [] = []$
by (*simp add: app-subst-list*)

lemma *app-subst-Cons* [*simp*]: $\$s\ (t\ \#\ ts) = (\$s\ t)\ \# (\$s\ ts)$
by (*simp add: app-subst-list*)

lemma *new-tv-TVar* [*simp*]: $new\text{-tv } n\ (TVar\ m) = (m < n)$
by (*simp add: new-tv-def*)

```

lemma new-tv-Fun [simp]:
  new-tv n (t1  $\rightarrow$  t2) = (new-tv n t1  $\wedge$  new-tv n t2)
  by (auto simp add: new-tv-def)

lemma new-tv-Nil [simp]: new-tv n []
  by (simp add: new-tv-def)

lemma new-tv-Cons [simp]: new-tv n (t # ts) = (new-tv n t  $\wedge$  new-tv n ts)
  by (auto simp add: new-tv-def)

lemma new-tv-id-subst [simp]: new-tv n id-subst
  by (simp add: id-subst-def new-tv-def free-tv-subst dom-def cod-def)

lemma new-tv-subst:
  new-tv n s =
    (( $\forall m. n \leq m \rightarrow s\ m = \text{TVar } m$ )  $\wedge$ 
     ( $\forall l. l < n \rightarrow \text{new-tv } n\ (s\ l)$ ))
  apply (unfold new-tv-def)
  apply (tactic safe-tac HOL-cs)
   $\rightarrow$   $\Rightarrow$ 
    apply (tactic  $\ll$  fast-tac (HOL-cs addDs [leD] addss (simpset()
      addsimps [thm free-tv-subst, thm dom-def])) 1  $\gg$ )
    apply (subgoal-tac m  $\in$  cod s  $\vee$  s l = TVar l)
    apply (tactic safe-tac HOL-cs)
    apply (tactic  $\ll$  fast-tac (HOL-cs addDs [UnI2] addss (simpset()
      addsimps [thm free-tv-subst])) 1  $\gg$ )
    apply (drule-tac P =  $\lambda x. m \in \text{free-tv } x$  in subst, assumption)
    apply simp
    apply (tactic  $\ll$  fast-tac (set-cs addss (simpset()
      addsimps [thm free-tv-subst, thm cod-def, thm dom-def])) 1  $\gg$ )
   $\rightarrow$   $\Leftarrow$ 
    apply (unfold free-tv-subst cod-def dom-def)
    apply (tactic safe-tac set-cs)
    apply (cut-tac m = m and n = n in less-linear)
    apply (tactic fast-tac (HOL-cs addSIs [less-or-eq-imp-le] 1) 1)
    apply (cut-tac m = ma and n = n in less-linear)
    apply (fast intro!: less-or-eq-imp-le)
  done

lemma new-tv-list: new-tv n x = ( $\forall y \in \text{set } x. \text{new-tv } n\ y$ )
  by (induct x) simp-all

lemma subst-te-new-tv [simp]:
  new-tv n (t::typ)  $\rightarrow$   $\$(\lambda x. \text{if } x = n \text{ then } t' \text{ else } s\ x)\ t = \$s\ t$ 
  — substitution affects only variables occurring freely
  by (induct t) simp-all

lemma subst-tel-new-tv [simp]:
  new-tv n (ts::typ list)  $\rightarrow$   $\$(\lambda x. \text{if } x = n \text{ then } t \text{ else } s\ x)\ ts = \$s\ ts$ 

```

```

by (induct ts) simp-all

lemma new-tv-le:  $n \leq m \implies \text{new-tv } n \ (t::\text{typ}) \implies \text{new-tv } m \ t$ 
  — all greater variables are also new
proof (induct t)
  case (TVar n)
  thus ?case by (auto intro: less-le-trans)
next
  case TFun
  thus ?case by simp
qed

lemma [simp]:  $\text{new-tv } n \ t \implies \text{new-tv } (\text{Suc } n) \ (t::\text{typ})$ 
  by (rule lessI [THEN less-imp-le [THEN new-tv-le]])

lemma new-tv-list-le:
   $n \leq m \implies \text{new-tv } n \ (ts::\text{typ list}) \implies \text{new-tv } m \ ts$ 
proof (induct ts)
  case Nil
  thus ?case by simp
next
  case Cons
  thus ?case by (auto intro: new-tv-le)
qed

lemma [simp]:  $\text{new-tv } n \ ts \implies \text{new-tv } (\text{Suc } n) \ (ts::\text{typ list})$ 
  by (rule lessI [THEN less-imp-le [THEN new-tv-list-le]])

lemma new-tv-subst-le:  $n \leq m \implies \text{new-tv } n \ (s::\text{subst}) \implies \text{new-tv } m \ s$ 
  apply (simp add: new-tv-subst)
  apply clarify
  apply (rule-tac  $P = l < n$  and  $Q = n \leq l$  in disjE)
  apply clarify
  apply (simp-all add: new-tv-le)
  done

lemma [simp]:  $\text{new-tv } n \ s \implies \text{new-tv } (\text{Suc } n) \ (s::\text{subst})$ 
  by (rule lessI [THEN less-imp-le [THEN new-tv-subst-le]])

lemma new-tv-subst-var:
   $n < m \implies \text{new-tv } m \ (s::\text{subst}) \implies \text{new-tv } m \ (s \ n)$ 
  — new-tv property remains if a substitution is applied
  by (simp add: new-tv-subst)

lemma new-tv-subst-te [simp]:
   $\text{new-tv } n \ s \implies \text{new-tv } n \ (t::\text{typ}) \implies \text{new-tv } n \ (\$s \ t)$ 
  by (induct t) (auto simp add: new-tv-subst)

lemma new-tv-subst-tel [simp]:

```

$new-tv\ n\ s \implies new-tv\ n\ (ts::typ\ list) \implies new-tv\ n\ (\$s\ ts)$
by (*induct ts*) (*fastsimp simp add: new-tv-subst*)⁺

lemma *new-tv-Suc-list*: $new-tv\ n\ ts \dashrightarrow new-tv\ (Suc\ n)\ (TVar\ n\ \#\ ts)$
— auxilliary lemma
by (*simp add: new-tv-list*)

lemma *new-tv-subst-comp-1* [*simp*]:
 $new-tv\ n\ (s::subst) \implies new-tv\ n\ r \implies new-tv\ n\ (\$r\ o\ s)$
— composition of substitutions preserves *new-tv* proposition
by (*simp add: new-tv-subst*)

lemma *new-tv-subst-comp-2* [*simp*]:
 $new-tv\ n\ (s::subst) \implies new-tv\ n\ r \implies new-tv\ n\ (\lambda v. \$r\ (s\ v))$
by (*simp add: new-tv-subst*)

lemma *new-tv-not-free-tv* [*simp*]: $new-tv\ n\ ts \implies n \notin free-tv\ ts$
— new type variables do not occur freely in a type structure
by (*auto simp add: new-tv-def*)

lemma *ftv-mem-sub-ftv-list* [*simp*]:
 $(t::typ) \in set\ ts \implies free-tv\ t \subseteq free-tv\ ts$
by (*induct ts*) *auto*

If two substitutions yield the same result if applied to a type structure the substitutions coincide on the free type variables occurring in the type structure.

lemma *eq-subst-te-eq-free*:
 $\$s1\ (t::typ) = \$s2\ t \implies n \in free-tv\ t \implies s1\ n = s2\ n$
by (*induct t*) *auto*

lemma *eq-free-eq-subst-te*:
 $(\forall n. n \in free-tv\ t \dashrightarrow s1\ n = s2\ n) \implies \$s1\ (t::typ) = \$s2\ t$
by (*induct t*) *auto*

lemma *eq-subst-tel-eq-free*:
 $\$s1\ (ts::typ\ list) = \$s2\ ts \implies n \in free-tv\ ts \implies s1\ n = s2\ n$
by (*induct ts*) (*auto intro: eq-subst-te-eq-free*)

lemma *eq-free-eq-subst-tel*:
 $(\forall n. n \in free-tv\ ts \dashrightarrow s1\ n = s2\ n) \implies \$s1\ (ts::typ\ list) = \$s2\ ts$
by (*induct ts*) (*auto intro: eq-free-eq-subst-te*)

Some useful lemmas.

lemma *codD*: $v \in cod\ s \implies v \in free-tv\ s$
by (*simp add: free-tv-subst*)

lemma *not-free-impl-id*: $x \notin free-tv\ s \implies s\ x = TVar\ x$

```

by (simp add: free-tv-subst dom-def)

lemma free-tv-le-new-tv: new-tv n t  $\implies$  m  $\in$  free-tv t  $\implies$  m < n
  by (unfold new-tv-def) fast

lemma free-tv-subst-var: free-tv (s (v::nat))  $\leq$  insert v (cod s)
  by (cases v  $\in$  dom s) (auto simp add: cod-def dom-def)

lemma free-tv-app-subst-te: free-tv ($s (t::typ))  $\subseteq$  cod s  $\cup$  free-tv t
  by (induct t) (auto simp add: free-tv-subst-var)

lemma free-tv-app-subst-tel: free-tv ($s (ts::typ list))  $\subseteq$  cod s  $\cup$  free-tv ts
  apply (induct ts)
  apply simp
  apply (cut-tac free-tv-app-subst-te)
  apply fastsimp
  done

lemma free-tv-comp-subst:
  free-tv ( $\lambda u::nat.$  $s1 (s2 u) :: typ)  $\subseteq$  free-tv s1  $\cup$  free-tv s2
  apply (unfold free-tv-subst dom-def)
  apply (tactic <<
    fast-tac (set-cs addSDs [thm free-tv-app-subst-te RS subsetD,
      thm free-tv-subst-var RS subsetD]
      addss (simpset() delsimps bex-simps
        addsimps [thm cod-def, thm dom-def])) 1 >>>)
  done

```

2.2 Most general unifiers

consts

mgu :: typ \Rightarrow typ \Rightarrow subst maybe

axioms

mgu-eq [simp]: mgu t1 t2 = Ok u \implies \$u t1 = \$u t2

mgu-mg [simp]: mgu t1 t2 = Ok u \implies \$s t1 = \$s t2 \implies $\exists r. s = $r o u$

mgu-Ok: \$s t1 = \$s t2 \implies $\exists u. mgu t1 t2 = Ok u$

mgu-free [simp]: mgu t1 t2 = Ok u \implies free-tv u \subseteq free-tv t1 \cup free-tv t2

lemma *mgu-new: mgu t1 t2 = Ok u \implies new-tv n t1 \implies new-tv n t2 \implies new-tv n u*

— *mgu* does not introduce new type variables

by (*unfold new-tv-def*) (*blast dest: mgu-free*)

3 Mini-ML with type inference rules

datatype

expr = Var nat | Abs expr | App expr expr

Type inference rules.

consts

$has\text{-}type :: (typ\ list \times expr \times typ) \ set$

syntax

$-has\text{-}type :: typ\ list \Rightarrow expr \Rightarrow typ \Rightarrow bool$
 $(((-) \mid - / (-) :: (-)) [60, 0, 60] 60)$

translations

$a \mid - e :: t == (a, e, t) \in has\text{-}type$

inductive $has\text{-}type$

intros

$Var: n < length\ a \Longrightarrow a \mid - Var\ n :: a\ !\ n$
 $Abs: t1 \# a \mid - e :: t2 \Longrightarrow a \mid - Abs\ e :: t1 \rightarrow t2$
 $App: a \mid - e1 :: t2 \rightarrow t1 \Longrightarrow a \mid - e2 :: t2$
 $\Longrightarrow a \mid - App\ e1\ e2 :: t1$

Type assignment is closed wrt. substitution.

lemma $has\text{-}type\text{-}subst\text{-}closed: a \mid - e :: t ==> \$s\ a \mid - e :: \$s\ t$

proof –

assume $a \mid - e :: t$

thus $?thesis$ (**is** $?P\ a\ e\ t$)

proof *induct*

case $(Var\ a\ n)$

hence $n < length\ (map\ (\$s)\ a)$ **by** *simp*

hence $map\ (\$s)\ a \mid - Var\ n :: map\ (\$s)\ a\ !\ n$

by $(rule\ has\text{-}type.Var)$

also have $map\ (\$s)\ a\ !\ n = \$s\ (a\ !\ n)$

by $(rule\ nth\text{-}map)$

also have $map\ (\$s)\ a = \$s\ a$

by $(simp\ only: app\text{-}subst\text{-}list)$

finally show $?P\ a\ (Var\ n)\ (a\ !\ n)$.

next

case $(Abs\ a\ e\ t1\ t2)$

hence $\$s\ t1 \# map\ (\$s)\ a \mid - e :: \$s\ t2$

by $(simp\ add: app\text{-}subst\text{-}list)$

hence $map\ (\$s)\ a \mid - Abs\ e :: \$s\ t1 \rightarrow \$s\ t2$

by $(rule\ has\text{-}type.Abs)$

thus $?P\ a\ (Abs\ e)\ (t1 \rightarrow t2)$

by $(simp\ add: app\text{-}subst\text{-}list)$

next

case App

thus $?case$ **by** $(simp\ add: has\text{-}type.App)$

qed

qed

4 Correctness and completeness of the type inference algorithm \mathcal{W}

consts

$W :: \text{expr} \Rightarrow \text{typ list} \Rightarrow \text{nat} \Rightarrow (\text{subst} \times \text{typ} \times \text{nat}) \text{ maybe } (W)$

primrec

$\mathcal{W} (\text{Var } i) \ a \ n =$
 (if $i < \text{length } a$ then $\text{Ok } (\text{id-subst}, a ! i, n)$ else Fail)
 $\mathcal{W} (\text{Abs } e) \ a \ n =$
 ((s, t, m) := $\mathcal{W} \ e \ (\text{TVar } n \ \# \ a) \ (\text{Suc } n)$;
 $\text{Ok } (s, (s \ n) \rightarrow t, m)$)
 $\mathcal{W} (\text{App } e1 \ e2) \ a \ n =$
 (($s1, t1, m1$) := $\mathcal{W} \ e1 \ a \ n$;
 ($s2, t2, m2$) := $\mathcal{W} \ e2 \ (\$s1 \ a) \ m1$;
 $u := \text{mgu } (\$ \ s2 \ t1) \ (t2 \rightarrow \text{TVar } m2)$;
 $\text{Ok } (\$u \ o \ \$s2 \ o \ s1, \$u \ (\text{TVar } m2), \text{Suc } m2)$)

theorem $W\text{-correct}$: $!!a \ s \ t \ m \ n. \ \text{Ok } (s, t, m) = \mathcal{W} \ e \ a \ n \implies \$s \ a \ |- \ e :: t$
 (is $\text{PROP } ?P \ e$)

proof (induct e)

fix $a \ s \ t \ m \ n$
 {
 fix i
 assume $\text{Ok } (s, t, m) = \mathcal{W} (\text{Var } i) \ a \ n$
 thus $\$s \ a \ |- \ \text{Var } i :: t$ **by** ($\text{simp add: has-type.Var split: if-splits}$)
next
 fix e **assume** $\text{hyp: PROP } ?P \ e$
 assume $\text{Ok } (s, t, m) = \mathcal{W} (\text{Abs } e) \ a \ n$
 then obtain t' **where** $t = s \ n \rightarrow t'$
 and $\text{Ok } (s, t', m) = \mathcal{W} \ e \ (\text{TVar } n \ \# \ a) \ (\text{Suc } n)$
 by ($\text{auto split: bind-splits}$)
 with hyp show $\$s \ a \ |- \ \text{Abs } e :: t$
 by ($\text{force intro: has-type.Abs}$)
next
 fix $e1 \ e2$ **assume** $\text{hyp1: PROP } ?P \ e1$ **and** $\text{hyp2: PROP } ?P \ e2$
 assume $\text{Ok } (s, t, m) = \mathcal{W} (\text{App } e1 \ e2) \ a \ n$
 then obtain $s1 \ t1 \ n1 \ s2 \ t2 \ n2 \ u$ **where**
 $s: s = \$u \ o \ \$s2 \ o \ s1$
 and $t: t = u \ n2$
 and $\text{mgu-ok: mgu } (\$s2 \ t1) \ (t2 \rightarrow \text{TVar } n2) = \text{Ok } u$
 and $W1\text{-ok: Ok } (s1, t1, n1) = \mathcal{W} \ e1 \ a \ n$
 and $W2\text{-ok: Ok } (s2, t2, n2) = \mathcal{W} \ e2 \ (\$s1 \ a) \ n1$
 by ($\text{auto split: bind-splits simp: that}$)
 show $\$s \ a \ |- \ \text{App } e1 \ e2 :: t$
proof (rule has-type.App)
 from s **have** $s': \$u \ (\$s2 \ (\$s1 \ a)) = \$s \ a$
 by ($\text{simp add: subst-comp-tel o-def}$)
 show $\$s \ a \ |- \ e1 :: \$u \ t2 \rightarrow t$

```

proof –
  from W1-ok have  $\$s1\ a \mid -\ e1 :: t1$  by (rule hyp1)
  hence  $\$u\ (\$s2\ (\$s1\ a)) \mid -\ e1 :: \$u\ (\$s2\ t1)$ 
    by (intro has-type-subst-closed)
  with  $s'\ t\ mgu-ok$  show ?thesis by simp
qed
show  $\$s\ a \mid -\ e2 :: \$u\ t2$ 
proof –
  from W2-ok have  $\$s2\ (\$s1\ a) \mid -\ e2 :: t2$  by (rule hyp2)
  hence  $\$u\ (\$s2\ (\$s1\ a)) \mid -\ e2 :: \$u\ t2$ 
    by (rule has-type-subst-closed)
  with  $s'$  show ?thesis by simp
qed
qed
}
qed

```

inductive-cases *has-type-casesE*:

```

 $s \mid -\ Var\ n :: t$ 
 $s \mid -\ Abs\ e :: t$ 
 $s \mid -\ App\ e1\ e2 :: t$ 

```

lemmas [*simp*] = *Suc-le-lessD*
and [*simp del*] = *less-imp-le ex-simps all-simps*

lemma *W-var-ge* [*simp*]: $!!a\ n\ s\ t\ m. \mathcal{W}\ e\ a\ n = Ok\ (s, t, m) \implies n \leq m$
— the resulting type variable is always greater or equal than the given one
apply (*atomize (full)*)
apply (*induct e*)

case *Var n*

apply *clarsimp*

case *Abs e*

apply (*simp split add: split-bind*)
apply (*fast dest: Suc-leD*)

case *App e1 e2*

apply (*simp (no-asm) split add: split-bind*)
apply (*intro strip*)
apply (*rename-tac s t na sa ta nb sb*)
apply (*erule-tac x = a in allE*)
apply (*erule-tac x = n in allE*)
apply (*erule-tac x = \$s a in allE*)
apply (*erule-tac x = s in allE*)
apply (*erule-tac x = t in allE*)
apply (*erule-tac x = na in allE*)

```

apply (erule-tac  $x = na$  in  $allE$ )
apply (simp add: eq-sym-conv)
done

lemma  $W\text{-var-geD}$ :  $Ok(s, t, m) = \mathcal{W} e a n \implies n \leq m$ 
by (simp add: eq-sym-conv)

lemma  $new\text{-tv-}W$ :  $!!n a s t m.$ 
 $new\text{-tv } n a \implies \mathcal{W} e a n = Ok(s, t, m) \implies new\text{-tv } m s \ \& \ new\text{-tv } m t$ 
— resulting type variable is new
apply (atomize (full))
apply (induct  $e$ )

case  $Var\ n$ 
apply clarsimp
apply (force elim: list-ball-nth simp add: id-subst-def new-tv-list new-tv-subst)

case  $Abs\ e$ 
apply (simp (no-asm) add: new-tv-subst new-tv-Suc-list split add: split-bind)
apply (intro strip)
apply (erule-tac  $x = Suc\ n$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = TVar\ n \# a$  in  $allE$ )
apply (fastsimp simp add: new-tv-subst new-tv-Suc-list)

case  $App\ e1\ e2$ 
apply (simp (no-asm) split add: split-bind)
apply (intro strip)
apply (rename-tac  $s\ t\ na\ sa\ ta\ nb\ sb$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = n$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = a$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = s$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = t$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = na$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = na$  in  $allE$ )
apply (simp add: eq-sym-conv)
apply (erule-tac  $x = \$s\ a$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = sa$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = ta$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = nb$  in  $allE$ )
apply (simp add: o-def rotate-Ok)
apply (rule conjI)
apply (rule new-tv-subst-comp-2)
apply (rule new-tv-subst-comp-2)
apply (rule lessI [THEN less-imp-le, THEN new-tv-subst-le])
apply (rule-tac  $n = na$  in new-tv-subst-le)
apply (simp add: rotate-Ok)
apply (simp (no-asm-simp))
apply (fast dest:  $W\text{-var-geD}$  intro: new-tv-list-le new-tv-subst-tel
lessI [THEN less-imp-le, THEN new-tv-subst-le])

```

```

apply (erule sym [THEN mgu-new])
apply (best dest: W-var-geD intro: new-tv-subst-te new-tv-list-le new-tv-subst-tel
  lessI [THEN less-imp-le, THEN new-tv-le] lessI [THEN less-imp-le, THEN
new-tv-subst-le]
  new-tv-le)
apply (tactic << fast-tac (HOL-cs addDs [thm W-var-geD]
  addIs [thm new-tv-list-le, thm new-tv-subst-tel, thm new-tv-le]
  addss (simpset())) 1 >>)
apply (rule lessI [THEN new-tv-subst-var])
apply (erule sym [THEN mgu-new])
apply (bestsimp intro!: lessI [THEN less-imp-le, THEN new-tv-le] new-tv-subst-te
  dest!: W-var-geD intro: new-tv-list-le new-tv-subst-tel
  lessI [THEN less-imp-le, THEN new-tv-subst-le] new-tv-le)
apply (tactic << fast-tac (HOL-cs addDs [thm W-var-geD]
  addIs [thm new-tv-list-le, thm new-tv-subst-tel, thm new-tv-le]
  addss (simpset())) 1 >>)
done

```

```

lemma free-tv-W: !!n a s t m v. W e a n = Ok (s, t, m) ==>
  (v ∈ free-tv s ∨ v ∈ free-tv t) ==> v < n ==> v ∈ free-tv a
apply (atomize (full))
apply (induct e)

```

case Var n

```

apply clarsimp
apply (tactic << fast-tac (HOL-cs addIs [nth-mem, subsetD, thm ftv-mem-sub-ftv-list]
1 >>)

```

case Abs e

```

apply (simp add: free-tv-subst split add: split-bind)
apply (intro strip)
apply (rename-tac s t n1 v)
apply (erule-tac x = Suc n in allE)
apply (erule-tac x = TVar n # a in allE)
apply (erule-tac x = s in allE)
apply (erule-tac x = t in allE)
apply (erule-tac x = n1 in allE)
apply (erule-tac x = v in allE)
apply (force elim!: allE intro: cod-app-subst)

```

case App e1 e2

```

apply (simp (no-asm) split add: split-bind)
apply (intro strip)
apply (rename-tac s t n1 s1 t1 n2 s3 v)
apply (erule-tac x = n in allE)
apply (erule-tac x = a in allE)
apply (erule-tac x = s in allE)
apply (erule-tac x = t in allE)
apply (erule-tac x = n1 in allE)

```

apply (*erule-tac* $x = n1$ **in** *allE*)
apply (*erule-tac* $x = v$ **in** *allE*)

second case

apply (*erule-tac* $x = \$ s a$ **in** *allE*)
apply (*erule-tac* $x = s1$ **in** *allE*)
apply (*erule-tac* $x = t1$ **in** *allE*)
apply (*erule-tac* $x = n2$ **in** *allE*)
apply (*erule-tac* $x = v$ **in** *allE*)
apply (*tactic safe-tac* (*empty-cs addSIs* [*conjI*, *impI*] *addSEs* [*conjE*]))
apply (*simp add: rotate-Ok o-def*)
apply (*drule W-var-geD*)
apply (*drule W-var-geD*)
apply (*frule less-le-trans, assumption*)
apply (*fastsimp dest: free-tv-comp-subst* [*THEN subsetD*] *sym* [*THEN mgu-free*]
codD
free-tv-app-subst-te [*THEN subsetD*] *free-tv-app-subst-tel* [*THEN subsetD*] *subsetD elim: UnE*)
apply *simp*
apply (*drule sym* [*THEN W-var-geD*])
apply (*drule sym* [*THEN W-var-geD*])
apply (*frule less-le-trans, assumption*)
apply (*tactic* \ll *fast-tac* (*HOL-cs addDs* [*thm mgu-free, thm codD,*
thm free-tv-subst-var RS subsetD,
thm free-tv-app-subst-te RS subsetD,
thm free-tv-app-subst-tel RS subsetD, less-le-trans, subsetD]
addSEs [*UnE*] *addss* (*simpset()* *setSolver unsafe-solver*)) *1* \gg)
— builtin arithmetic in *simpset* messes things up
done

Completeness of \mathcal{W} wrt. *has-type*.

lemma *W-complete-aux*: $!!s' a t' n. \$s' a \mid - e :: t' \Longrightarrow new-tv n a \Longrightarrow$
 $(\exists s t. (\exists m. \mathcal{W} e a n = Ok (s, t, m)) \wedge (\exists r. \$s' a = \$r (\$s a) \wedge t' = \$r t))$
apply (*atomize* (*full*))
apply (*induct* *e*)

case *Var n*

apply (*intro strip*)
apply (*simp* (*no-asm*) *cong add: conj-cong*)
apply (*erule has-type-casesE*)
apply (*simp add: eq-sym-conv app-subst-list*)
apply (*rule-tac* $x = s'$ **in** *exI*)
apply *simp*

case *Abs e*

apply (*intro strip*)
apply (*erule has-type-casesE*)
apply (*erule-tac* $x = \lambda x. \text{if } x = n \text{ then } t1 \text{ else } (s' x)$ **in** *allE*)

```

apply (erule-tac  $x = TVar\ n \ \# \ a$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = t2$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = Suc\ n$  in  $allE$ )
apply (fastsimp cong add: conj-cong split add: split-bind)

case App e1 e2

apply (intro strip)
apply (erule has-type-casesE)
apply (erule-tac  $x = s'$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = a$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = t2 \rightarrow t'$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = n$  in  $allE$ )
apply (tactic safe-tac HOL-cs)
apply (erule-tac  $x = r$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = \$s\ a$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = t2$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = m$  in  $allE$ )
apply simp
apply (tactic safe-tac HOL-cs)
apply (tactic  $\ll$  fast-tac (HOL-cs addIs [sym RS thm W-var-geD,
  thm new-tv-W RS conjunct1, thm new-tv-list-le, thm new-tv-subst-tel]) 1  $\gg$ )
apply (subgoal-tac
   $\$(\lambda x. \text{if } x = ma \text{ then } t' \text{ else } (\text{if } x \in \text{free-tv } t - \text{free-tv } sa \text{ then } r\ x$ 
     $\text{else } ra\ x)) (\$ sa\ t) =$ 
   $\$(\lambda x. \text{if } x = ma \text{ then } t' \text{ else } (\text{if } x \in \text{free-tv } t - \text{free-tv } sa \text{ then } r\ x$ 
     $\text{else } ra\ x)) (ta \rightarrow (TVar\ ma)))$ 
apply (rule-tac [2]  $t = \$(\lambda x. \text{if } x = ma \text{ then } t'$ 
   $\text{else } (\text{if } x \in (\text{free-tv } t - \text{free-tv } sa) \text{ then } r\ x \text{ else } ra\ x)) (\$sa\ t)$  and
   $s = (\$ ra\ ta) \rightarrow t'$  in  $ssubst$ )
prefer 2
apply (simp add: subst-comp-te)
apply (rule eq-free-eq-subst-te)
apply (intro strip)
apply (subgoal-tac  $na \neq ma$ )
prefer 2
apply (fast dest: new-tv-W sym [THEN W-var-geD] new-tv-not-free-tv new-tv-le)
apply (case-tac  $na \in \text{free-tv } sa$ )

 $na \notin \text{free-tv } sa$ 

prefer 2
apply (frule not-free-impl-id)
apply simp

 $na \in \text{free-tv } sa$ 

apply (drule-tac  $ts1 = \$s\ a$  and  $r = \$ r (\$ s\ a)$  in subst-comp-tel [THEN [2]
trans])
apply (drule-tac eq-subst-tel-eq-free)
apply (fast intro: free-tv-W free-tv-le-new-tv dest: new-tv-W)
apply simp

```

```

    apply (case-tac na ∈ dom sa)
    prefer 2

na ≠ dom sa

    apply (simp add: dom-def)

na ∈ dom sa

    apply (rule eq-free-eq-subst-te)
    apply (intro strip)
    apply (subgoal-tac nb ≠ ma)
    prefer 2
    apply (frule new-tv-W, assumption)
    apply (erule conjE)
    apply (drule new-tv-subst-tel)
    apply (fast intro: new-tv-list-le dest: sym [THEN W-var-geD])
    apply (fastsimp dest: new-tv-W new-tv-not-free-tv simp add: cod-def free-tv-subst)
    apply (fastsimp simp add: cod-def free-tv-subst)
    prefer 2
    apply (simp (no-asm))
    apply (rule eq-free-eq-subst-te)
    apply (intro strip)
    apply (subgoal-tac na ≠ ma)
    prefer 2
    apply (frule new-tv-W, assumption)
    apply (erule conjE)
    apply (drule sym [THEN W-var-geD])
    apply (fast dest: new-tv-list-le new-tv-subst-tel new-tv-W new-tv-not-free-tv)
    apply (case-tac na ∈ free-tv t - free-tv sa)
    prefer 2

case na ∉ free-tv t - free-tv sa

    apply simp
    defer

case na ∈ free-tv t - free-tv sa

    apply simp
    apply (drule-tac ts1 = $s a and r = $ r ($ s a) in subst-comp-tel [THEN [2]
trans])
    apply (drule eq-subst-tel-eq-free)
    apply (fast intro: free-tv-W free-tv-le-new-tv dest: new-tv-W)
    apply (simp add: free-tv-subst dom-def)
    prefer 2 apply fast
    apply (simp (no-asm-simp) split add: split-bind)
    apply (tactic safe-tac HOL-cs)
    apply (drule mgu-Ok)
    apply fastsimp
    apply (drule mgu-mg, assumption)
    apply (erule exE)
    apply (rule-tac x = rb in exI)

```



```

apply (rule conjI)
prefer 2
apply (drule-tac x = ma in fun-cong)
apply (simp add: eq-sym-conv)
apply (simp (no-asm) add: o-def subst-comp-tel [symmetric])
apply (rule subst-comp-tel [symmetric, THEN [2] trans])
apply (simp add: o-def eq-sym-conv)
apply (rule eq-free-eq-subst-tel)
apply (tactic safe-tac HOL-cs)
apply (subgoal-tac ma  $\neq$  na)
prefer 2
apply (frule new-tv-W, assumption)
apply (erule conjE)
apply (drule new-tv-subst-tel)
apply (fast intro: new-tv-list-le dest: sym [THEN W-var-geD])
apply (frule-tac n = m in new-tv-W, assumption)
apply (erule conjE)
apply (drule free-tv-app-subst-tel [THEN subsetD])
apply (tactic  $\ll$  fast-tac (set-cs addDs [sym RS thm W-var-geD, thm new-tv-list-le,
  thm codD, thm new-tv-not-free-tv]) 1  $\gg$ )
apply (case-tac na  $\in$  free-tv t - free-tv sa)
prefer 2

case na  $\notin$  free-tv t - free-tv sa

apply simp
defer

case na  $\in$  free-tv t - free-tv sa

apply simp
apply (drule free-tv-app-subst-tel [THEN subsetD])
apply (fastsimp dest: codD subst-comp-tel [THEN [2] trans]
  eq-subst-tel-eq-free simp add: free-tv-subst dom-def)
apply fast
done

lemma W-complete:  $\Box \mid - e :: t' ==>$ 
 $\exists s t. (\exists m. \mathcal{W} e \Box n = Ok (s, t, m)) \wedge (\exists r. t' = \$r t)$ 
apply (cut-tac a =  $\Box$  and s' = id-subst and e = e and t' = t' in W-complete-aux)
apply simp-all
done

```

5 Equivalence of W and I

Recursive definition of type inference algorithm \mathcal{I} for Mini-ML.

consts

$I :: \text{expr} \Rightarrow \text{typ list} \Rightarrow \text{nat} \Rightarrow \text{subst} \Rightarrow (\text{subst} \times \text{typ} \times \text{nat}) \text{ maybe } (\mathcal{I})$

primrec

$\mathcal{I} (\text{Var } i) a n s = (\text{if } i < \text{length } a \text{ then } Ok (s, a ! i, n) \text{ else } Fail)$

```

 $\mathcal{I} \text{ (Abs } e) \text{ } a \text{ } n \text{ } s = ((s, t, m) := \mathcal{I} \text{ } e \text{ (TVar } n \text{ \# } a) \text{ (Suc } n) \text{ } s;$ 
 $\text{Ok } (s, \text{TVar } n \text{ } \rightarrow t, m))$ 
 $\mathcal{I} \text{ (App } e1 \text{ } e2) \text{ } a \text{ } n \text{ } s =$ 
 $((s1, t1, m1) := \mathcal{I} \text{ } e1 \text{ } a \text{ } n \text{ } s;$ 
 $(s2, t2, m2) := \mathcal{I} \text{ } e2 \text{ } a \text{ } m1 \text{ } s1;$ 
 $u := \text{mgu } (\$s2 \text{ } t1) (\$s2 \text{ } t2 \text{ } \rightarrow \text{TVar } m2);$ 
 $\text{Ok}(\$u \text{ } o \text{ } s2, \text{TVar } m2, \text{Suc } m2))$ 

```

Correctness.

lemma *I-correct-wrt-W*: $!!a \text{ } m \text{ } s \text{ } s' \text{ } t \text{ } n.$

```

 $\text{new-tv } m \text{ } a \wedge \text{new-tv } m \text{ } s \implies \mathcal{I} \text{ } e \text{ } a \text{ } m \text{ } s = \text{Ok } (s', t, n) \implies$ 
 $\exists r. \mathcal{W} \text{ } e \text{ } (\$s \text{ } a) \text{ } m = \text{Ok } (r, \$s' \text{ } t, n) \wedge s' = (\$r \text{ } o \text{ } s)$ 

```

```

apply (atomize (full))
apply (induct e)

```

case *Var* *n*

```

apply (simp add: app-subst-list split: split-if)

```

case *Abs* *e*

```

apply (tactic << asm-full-simp-tac
  (simpset() setloop (split-inside-tac [thm split-bind])) 1 >>)
apply (intro strip)
apply (rule conjI)
apply (intro strip)
apply (erule allE)+
apply (erule impE)
prefer 2 apply (fastsimp simp add: new-tv-subst)
apply (tactic << fast-tac (HOL-cs addIs [thm new-tv-Suc-list RS mp,
  thm new-tv-subst-le, less-imp-le, lessI]) 1 >>)
apply (intro strip)
apply (erule allE)+
apply (erule impE)
prefer 2 apply (fastsimp simp add: new-tv-subst)
apply (tactic << fast-tac (HOL-cs addIs [thm new-tv-Suc-list RS mp,
  thm new-tv-subst-le, less-imp-le, lessI]) 1 >>)

```

case *App* *e1* *e2*

```

apply (tactic << simp-tac (simpset () setloop (split-inside-tac [thm split-bind])) 1
>>)
apply (intro strip)
apply (rename-tac s1' t1 n1 s2' t2 n2 sa)
apply (rule conjI)
apply fastsimp
apply (intro strip)
apply (rename-tac s1 t1' n1')
apply (erule-tac x = a in allE)
apply (erule-tac x = m in allE)
apply (erule-tac x = s in allE)

```

```

apply (erule-tac  $x = s1'$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = t1$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = n1$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = a$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = n1$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = s1'$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = s2'$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = t2$  in  $allE$ )
apply (erule-tac  $x = n2$  in  $allE$ )
apply (rule  $conjI$ )
apply (intro  $strip$ )
apply (rule  $notI$ )
apply  $simp$ 
apply (erule  $impE$ )
  apply (frule  $new-tv-subst-tel$ ,  $assumption$ )
  apply (drule-tac  $a = \$s\ a$  in  $new-tv-W$ ,  $assumption$ )
  apply (fastsimp  $dest: sym\ [THEN\ W-var-geD]$   $new-tv-subst-le\ new-tv-list-le$ )
apply (fastsimp  $simp\ add: subst-comp-tel$ )
apply (intro  $strip$ )
apply (rename-tac  $s2\ t2'\ n2'$ )
apply (rule  $conjI$ )
apply (intro  $strip$ )
apply (rule  $notI$ )
apply  $simp$ 
apply (erule  $impE$ )
apply (frule  $new-tv-subst-tel$ ,  $assumption$ )
apply (drule-tac  $a = \$s\ a$  in  $new-tv-W$ ,  $assumption$ )
  apply (fastsimp  $dest: sym\ [THEN\ W-var-geD]$   $new-tv-subst-le\ new-tv-list-le$ )
apply (fastsimp  $simp\ add: subst-comp-tel\ subst-comp-te$ )
apply (intro  $strip$ )
apply (erule (1)  $notE\ impE$ )
apply (erule (1)  $notE\ impE$ )
apply (erule  $exE$ )
apply (erule  $conjE$ )
apply (erule  $impE$ )
apply (frule  $new-tv-subst-tel$ ,  $assumption$ )
apply (drule-tac  $a = \$s\ a$  in  $new-tv-W$ ,  $assumption$ )
  apply (fastsimp  $dest: sym\ [THEN\ W-var-geD]$   $new-tv-subst-le\ new-tv-list-le$ )
apply (erule (1)  $notE\ impE$ )
apply (erule  $exE\ conjE$ )+
apply (simp ( $asm-lr$ )  $add: subst-comp-tel\ subst-comp-te\ o-def$ , (erule  $conjE$ )+,
 $hypsubst$ )
apply (subgoal-tac  $new-tv\ n2\ s \wedge new-tv\ n2\ r \wedge new-tv\ n2\ ra$ )
  apply (simp  $add: new-tv-subst$ )
apply (frule  $new-tv-subst-tel$ ,  $assumption$ )
apply (drule-tac  $a = \$s\ a$  in  $new-tv-W$ ,  $assumption$ )
apply (tactic  $safe-tac\ HOL-cs$ )
  apply (bestsimp  $dest: sym\ [THEN\ W-var-geD]$   $new-tv-subst-le\ new-tv-list-le$ )
apply (fastsimp  $dest: sym\ [THEN\ W-var-geD]$   $new-tv-subst-le\ new-tv-list-le$ )

```

```

apply (drule-tac e = e1 in sym [THEN W-var-geD])
apply (drule new-tv-subst-tel, assumption)
apply (drule-tac ts = $s a in new-tv-list-le, assumption)
apply (drule new-tv-subst-tel, assumption)
apply (bestsimp dest: new-tv-W simp add: subst-comp-tel)
done

```

lemma *I-complete-wrt-W*: !!a m s.

```

  new-tv m a ∧ new-tv m s ⇒  $\mathcal{I}$  e a m s = Fail ⇒  $\mathcal{W}$  e ($s a) m = Fail
apply (atomize (full))
apply (induct e)
  apply (simp add: app-subst-list)
  apply (simp (no-asm))
  apply (intro strip)
  apply (subgoal-tac TVar m # $s a = $s (TVar m # a))
  apply (tactic ⟨ asm-simp-tac (HOL-ss addsimps
    [thm new-tv-Suc-list, lessI RS less-imp-le RS thm new-tv-subst-le] 1 ⟩))
  apply (erule conjE)
  apply (drule new-tv-not-free-tv [THEN not-free-impl-id])
  apply (simp (no-asm-simp))
apply (simp (no-asm-simp))
apply (intro strip)
apply (erule exE)+
apply (erule conjE)+
apply (drule I-correct-wrt-W [COMP swap-prems-rl])
  apply fast
apply (erule exE)
apply (erule conjE)
apply hypsubst
apply (simp (no-asm-simp))
apply (erule disjE)
apply (rule disjI1)
apply (simp (no-asm-use) add: o-def subst-comp-tel)
apply (erule allE, erule allE, erule allE, erule impE, erule-tac [2] impE,
  erule-tac [2] asm-rl, erule-tac [2] asm-rl)
apply (rule conjI)
  apply (fast intro: W-var-ge [THEN new-tv-list-le])
apply (rule new-tv-subst-comp-2)
  apply (fast intro: W-var-ge [THEN new-tv-subst-le])
apply (fast intro!: new-tv-subst-tel intro: new-tv-W [THEN conjunct1])
apply (rule disjI2)
apply (erule exE)+
apply (erule conjE)
apply (drule I-correct-wrt-W [COMP swap-prems-rl])
apply (rule conjI)
apply (fast intro: W-var-ge [THEN new-tv-list-le])
apply (rule new-tv-subst-comp-1)
apply (fast intro: W-var-ge [THEN new-tv-subst-le])
apply (fast intro!: new-tv-subst-tel intro: new-tv-W [THEN conjunct1])

```

```

apply (erule exE)
apply (erule conjE)
apply hypsubst
apply (simp add: o-def subst-comp-te [symmetric] subst-comp-tel [symmetric])
done

end

```